



The three judge panel of Fantasy Judge has rendered a 3-0 unanimous decision against the drop of Priest Holmes and the adding of Maurice Morris.

In support of the unanimous decision, Judge Harkins Writes:

I can see both Paul and Rich's sides in this disagreement. At it's core, I believe that the spirit of the rule was to allow teams to pick-up players due to injury, retirement or any other reason.

Unfortunately, the rules are written VERY clearly and specifically that a "4th pick-up can only be made if a player is put on injured reserve." While it may me a bit cut-throat by Mr. Fishkind, he is totally within the current rules, as they are now written, to contest this roster move.

As a strict constructionist, I can not rule that "de facto injured reserve" exists for a player that has retired. When judgments are handed down on the "intent" of a rule, we start on a slippery slope that will allow team owners to find any necessary rule either cogent or irrelevant depending upon their situation.

The rule as written in your league guidelines is clear and therefore I cannot allow this drop/add.

On a side note, might I suggest that Rich ask to have this rule changed for next season so that it is broader and allows for a drop/add in any situation. Last season, I lost a tie breaker to a team within my division that I had beaten twice and had a better divisional record. Our first tie-breaker was "points-for" giving the first-week playoff bye to a clearly inferior team.

Before this season's draft, I printed the NFL tiebreakers out and brought them to our draft night and had them installed as our leagues new tie-breaking system.

Judge Masci Writes:

I have to rule in favor of Paul Fishkind on this one. It's an unfortunate situation for the team with Priest Holmes but that is why fantasy rules are set before the season starts and this appears to be the case. You can't change the rules in the middle of the season.

I suggest that the league commissioner expands the IR term for next year to include if a player retires during the season or passes away.

Judge Mudry Writes:

I completely agree with Judge Harkins' and Judge Masci's decisions. The drop/add can not be allowed due to the current league rules.

I also suggest changing this rule before next season.